



INTRODUCTION

Look at Salary/Wage Scales for the Early Childhood Educator Workforce is intended to provide states and cities with the knowledge to begin developing early childhood workforce salary scales. This work is timely and necessary as the early childhood field, businesses, communities, states and the nation face the stark realities

of our growing child care crisis.

The continuing struggle of operating a high-quality early childhood program—paying wages commensurate with the skills and education needed, recruiting and retaining staff and setting tuition at a level families can afford—is more difficult than ever in this second year of a global pandemic. It was already challenging before the pandemic; now it is nearly impossible, as documented by workforce struggles across the country. A host of factors have collided that contribute to record numbers of programs closing and staffing shortages as early childhood professionals leave the field. Even with COVID-19 relief funds, more than one-third of respondents to a survey by the National Association for the Education of Young Children indicated they are considering leaving programs or closing their family child care homes in the next 12 months.¹ At the same time, there is reason to be hopeful as policy conversations at federal, state and local levels focus on funding to support early care and education (ECE).

Many of the policy conversations are about rebuilding or redesigning ECE. One critical component is rethinking ECE financing in order to improve educators' wages while not destablizing the system by sharply

The current ECE market functions because ECE professionals forgo a living wage aligned to the sophistication of their work." escalating the cost of care for families. Funding and instituting well-designed salary or wage scales that provide transparent and equitable wage lattices and make ECE a competitive career once again is one key strategy for rebuilding the ECE system. As defined by the Center

for the Study of Child Care

with clearly differentiated

Employment (CSCCE), a salary

schedule (or scale) is "a scale

—Illinois: Consensus Statement on Early Childhood Educator Compensation, August 2019

salary increments based on qualifications and years of experience, which provides guidance for salary increases over time."² It can also be thought of as a table of wage steps and ranges that provides a career pathway aligned to higher wages. While in some cases benefits are included in a salary scale, this white paper focuses on wages alone. The terms "salary schedule," "salary scale" and "wage scale" are used interchangeably herein, and all reflect a structure or system in place that specifies wages based on one or more criteria (e.g., education). A glossary is included as **Appendix I** on page 7.

While several states have developed wage scales and some have

legislation directing state offices to develop wage scales, few are currently implemented. Financing is the largest barrier. Without a significant infusion of additional public dollars, wage scales are not feasible because programs cannot afford to pay higher wages, especially as parents are currently the main source of funding for ECE. In states that use a salary scale, the scales are almost exclusively specific to publicly funded pre-K, where they has been tied to wage parity with public school pre-K or kindergarten teachers. While a step forward, such a limited wage scale does not serve the whole field, especially infant and toddler educators.

The state of Washington has gone further by creating a funding stream to support early educator wages and health benefits. Specifically, \$36 million dollars has been identified to increase wages and another \$30 million to provide health care coverage. This is possible because of a new, sustainable financing strategy. In the 2021 legislative session, lawmakers passed comprehensive legislation, <u>The Fair Start for Kids Act</u>, that uses federal relief funding to stabilize the state's ECE system. As these federal dollars run out, a portion of revenue raised by a new Capital Gains Excise Tax will provide funding for early educator wages and health care.

COMPONENTS OF A SALARY SCALE

Salary scales define expected earnings in a uniform way for an identified group of individuals. Scales have a series of levels, all with beginning and end points to promote fairness and transparency, and are based on predetermined criteria. Education and/or credential requirements are likely to be the primary criteria at each level, with training/professional development, relevant experience and/or roles and responsibilities also used in some states (e.g., Connecticut and Minnesota). Salary scales also typically define the number of hours worked per week and months per year, as well as the requirements for movement across the scale. For example, salary scales offer wage increases for additional education and/or credentials and sometimes for tenure and/or new roles/responsibilities. That is, an individual who earns a new degree while on the salary scale, reaches a longevity milestone or moves from assistant to lead educator may move up the scale or move to a higher wage within a level, depending on how the scale is structured.

THE BENEFITS OF A SALARY SCALE

A wage scale can serve as:

 A transparent, equitable matrix with pre-established criteria on which to base wages;

https://www.naeyc.org/sites/default/files/wysiwyg/user-74/naeyc_state_survey_data_august_2021.pdf

² https://cscce.berkeley.edu/workforce-index-2020/, page 271, note 122

- A recruitment and retention tool that can limit the churn of teachers obtaining credentials and moving to positions in public schools with higher wages and benefits;
- A step to higher quality by increasing recruitment and retention;
- A benchmark for early educator wages in relation to professionals with similar education in other fields (e.g., bachelor degrees);
- A budget planning tool based on expenses, not income, or what parents can afford;
- Guidelines for wage increases based on tenure, educational milestones reached and other factors; and
- An advocacy tool for restructuring early care and education financing.

KEY DECISION POINTS WHEN BUILDING A SALARY/WAGE SCALE

Several important decisions need to be made in the process of developing a salary scale. Each of these decision points is complex, with a host of considerations that must be made within the context of the state in which it will operate. No one set of decisions is right for every state, but rather, the choices must work in the regulatory and economic environment of the state. These decisions include:

- Eligibility
- Levels or Steps
- Benchmarking
- Parity or Equivalency
- Implementation Strategies
- Professional Growth

Below are some considerations for each decision point.

Eligibility: Who qualifies for participation?

States must consider which educators can participate. Will a salary schedule be limited to some educators or include all? Will other staff in EC programs qualify? And will family child care providers be eligible? While several states have made plans for all educators to be eligible, nearly all current wage scales are limited to pre-K educators. New York City has taken another step by extending their pre-K wage parity standards to community-based educators not working in pre-K classrooms,³ and the state of Washington passed legislation that makes all early educators eligible for their wage scale.

Appendix II on page 8 highlights several states that have proposed, but not yet enacted, wage scales for all early educators, and other states that have a wage scale for a segment of their workforce.

- In Connecticut, plans indicate that educators working in any state-funded program would be eligible to participate in the wage scale.
- Minnesota's proposed wage scale is intended for early childhood educators in all settings, including those working in family child care homes. The scale does not differentiate based on the age of children served, which recognizes that infant toddler educators are often paid even less than those working with older children.

- North Carolina's plan is designed for educators with credentials ranging from introductory certificates to those with pre-K certification, in all settings.
- In Oregon, the current wage scale is limited to educators working in three state-funded programs, with plans to make it available eventually to all early educators.
- In 2019, Rhode Island developed a plan that recommends strategies to improve compensation of professionals working with infants and toddlers (including home visitors and Early Intervention staff) and the strategies include "an aspirational target wage scale" with recommended minimum wages (See figure 1). Currently proposed legislation broadens eligibility to all early childhood educators.

Levels or Steps: What criteria will be used to define the levels?

Rather than developing a new set of criteria and levels, a salary scale can be based on an existing early childhood career lattice or on levels used in a state's Quality Rating and Improvement System (QRIS). A salary schedule can also inform and strengthen a state's QRIS. Scale developers in Connecticut must report to the legislature how the proposed wage scale will be included in the state's QRIS. In Illinois, a 2016 report recommended that the state's QRIS standards meet the compensation levels as proposed in the report.⁴

Some states have based their scale levels on NAEYC's <u>Power to</u> <u>the Profession</u>. Minnesota identified the ECE I, II and III as the basis upon which they built their scale and added a level before ECE I, so early childhood paraprofessionals would be included on the wage scale.

Scale developers must also consider how to make wage increments equitable within and between levels, and the basis used for those decisions. Typically, a researcher or statistician is engaged in this phase of development. In North Carolina, with funding from the state's Division of Child Development and Early Education, the University of North Carolina at Charlotte engaged stakeholders in focus groups and interviews to vet questions about the proposed scale and the proposed wage increments.

Benchmarking: How have states determined wage amounts on the scale?

States have used a few main criteria to determine wage amounts. Typically, wages are benchmarked against:

- A wage or salary floor above the state's minimum wage;
- A living wage (which can be calculated at a state or county level);
- A public school teacher salary, including these variations:
 - Public school kindergarten teachers
 - Public school elementary teachers
 - All public school teachers
- Finally, the scale can be benchmarked against workers with similar occupations or skill sets at similar education levels. Illinois used data from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics public datasets to examine wages related to educational attainment.

³ <u>https://cscce.berkeley.edu/workforce-index-2020/</u>, p.109.

⁴ Achieving Compensation Parity: Illinois Goal for the Field of Early Childhood Care and Education

More specifically, a wage schedule can identify a wage floor so every individual is guaranteed a wage that is some level above the state or federal minimum wage, and all wages are scaled from that point. Alternatively, a scale can represent a living wage or a self-sufficiency standard, both of which are generally recognized as the wages necessary to minimally meet basic needs and are typically assessed at a county or state level. However, because the wage floor and the living wage amounts are still low, the more frequently chosen option is a scale that creates wage parity between public school teachers and similarly qualified EC educators. In these cases, wages for educators with other qualifications are calculated as percentages of the full parity amount. A final option is a wage scale that benchmarks wages against other similarly educated individuals with similar job responsibilities in the state.

As noted earlier, Rhode Island's Moving the Needle on Compensation Taskforce developed a series of recommendations and compensation goals in 2019 for infant toddler educators. The proposed wage scale⁵, as seen below, has six levels with the highest level equivalent to the starting salary of kindergarten teachers adjusted for a 12-month, 40-hour work year.

Rhode Island's Aspirational Target Wage Scale Recommendation, 2019

FIG. 1 COMPENSATION GOALS

Infant/Toddler Educator Target Wage Scale, Rhode Island, 2019

LEVEL	EDUCATION	TARGET HOURLY WAGE FLOOR	12-MONTH Annual Salary Floor
1	CDA credential or 3 ECE credits	\$16	\$33,280
2	12 ECE credits	\$17	\$35,360
3	Associate's degree	\$19	\$39,520
4	Associate's degree & 24 ECE credits	\$20	\$41,600
5	Bachelor's degree	\$22	\$45,760
6	Bachelor's degree & 24 ECE credits	\$24.15	\$50,240

* Assumes that these amounts will need to be adjusted over time to account for inflation/ cost of living. Note: level 1 is \$1 more than the target for the minimum wage of \$15/hour and level 6 is equivalent to the starting kindergarten teacher salary in Rhode Island in 2017-2018 (\$41,869) adjusted to a 12-month schedule.

When determining what wages to use in a state's scale, it is possible that states could develop a combination of benchmarks. For example, Oregon developed a salary scale with both a required minimum wage and a target wage. The decision to have both wages articulated across the scale's levels recognizes the need to phase in the target wages as public funding becomes available.

Another example of how states are proceeding is Minnesota, where the planners considered a variety of criteria to determine its proposed wage scale. Their review included an "analysis of Minnesota's existing early childhood workforce, the wage trajectory of careers with similar educational requirements, consultation with the T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood[®] National Center and analysis of early childhood salary scales from Illinois, Nebraska, Oregon, Rhode Island and Washington."⁶ The planners' intention is that the wage scale will serve "as a recommendation that can be used to inform cost-estimate modeling for expanding access to high-quality early care and education programming, to advocate for state and local investments in early care and education markets, to provide a guide for fair and just compensation, and to strengthen the state's existing Quality Improvement and Assessment System (QRIS)."7

Finally, a wage scale should not be understood as having a cap or maximum dollar amount above which wages cannot go. Its purpose is to articulate wages at different levels that provide competitive salaries for early educators. Any program reaching the limits of a scale should not be deterred from continuing to pay educators at rates higher than the wage schedule suggests.

Parity (or Equivalency): For whom?

Defining parity in the context of salary scales is challenging because there are different definitions, depending upon the goals and intent of the scale. Parity can mean equivalent with an identified starting salary based on identified criteria (e.g. education), it can factor in hours and months worked as part of the equivalency, or instead mean similar, but not exactly the same wages as another identified group. Parity can also be focused only on wages, or more broadly on wages, benefits and professional supports (e.g., paid planning time). Parity can also be limited to certain settings or age groups. This paper focuses on wage parity alone and discusses the variety of settings and age groups that might be included in a wage schedule designed to create wage parity.

In Early Childhood Workforce Index 2020, CSCCE identifies the states that have implemented wage scales for pre-kindergarten teachers either in public school settings or in all pre-K settings as a means to achieve a measure of parity between equivalently credentialed early educators and public school teachers. In some states, wage parity applies to all lead educators with equivalent education (in either community-based or school settings), yet in other states, wage parity is limited to those working only in public school settings.⁸ As of the time of that report, six states (Alabama, Hawaii, Nevada, New Jersey,

- 5 https://www.rikidscount.org/Portals/0/FINAL%20InfantToddlerComp%2020%20page_web.pdf?ver=2019-12-06-163316-177 6 https://mn.gov/deed/newscenter/publications/trends/march-2021/earlycare-wagescale.jsp
- 7 ibid 8 https://cscce.berkeley.edu/workforce-index-2020/, p. 107

Oklahoma and Rhode Island) met the Index's criteria for pre-K salary parity in all pre-K settings/all programs as of the 2018-2019 school year, and 18 states achieved parity for pre-K educators in some settings. States that are considering wage schedules can learn from the efforts to achieve pre-K parity in these states. CSCCE's case studies focused on pre-K can help lead the way.⁹

How parity will be implemented in the state of Washington, with its groundbreaking 2021 Fair Start for Kids Act, will likely be guided by 2019 state legislation. One recommendation included in a 2019 report on compensation (funded by the state legislature) is that "early childhood educators receive a competitive compensation package comparable to K-3 educators."¹⁰

Implementation Strategies: Will the scale be implemented in phases or all at once?

As states develop wage scales, they must consider how to integrate the scale into their existing child care systems. Each state must decide if the scale will be phased in or available on the effective date of the new scale. In addition, the state must determine how any available funding will be distributed to programs, and on what basis. Several states have already created compensation guidelines and others have established groups to consider implementation plans.¹¹

To aid implementation and promote cross-department collaboration, Washington's legislature created a task force in 2018 to consider policy recommendations including those related to EC compensation. The Department of Commerce leads the task force and collaborates with the Department Children, Youth & Families.

North Carolina developed a model salary scale through its T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood[®] National Center Moving the Needle workgroup. It was designed as a guide to be used voluntarily at a local program level, and first shared as a resource in spring 2021 as programs developed summer transition plans. In fall 2021, North Carolina shared the wage scale as a resource for programs again when it began accepting applications for stabilization grants. The grants encourage programs to use the wage scale and have optional funding for programs to increase wages either permanently or with bonuses.

A final thought about implementation is to consider the future. Planners should develop guidelines for a periodic review of the salary scale and determine how and when changes will be made. For example, how often will there be an assessment of whether wage levels continue to be appropriate? What events or factors might trigger a scale review (e.g., legislation, additional funding, inflation)? Who would be involved in the review and who would make the decisions? Building guidelines like these into the initial planning process will help keep the salary scale current over time.

Professional Growth: How will individuals progress across the scale?

Wage scale developers must determine what criteria must be met, at what intervals (if any) and what documentation must be provided for an

Adequate compensation and a supportive professional environment are critical to ensuring that the early childhood workforce is diverse and highly qualified."

> —Elevating Nebraska's Early Childhood Workforce Executive Summary, January 2020

individual to move along the scale and increase their earnings. These decisions should be promoted as a way to encourage participation and professional development and demonstrate transparency about the scale. Again, existing career lattices can inform these decisions.

DATA NEEDED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH SALARY SCALE DEVELOPMENT

To make the best decisions when developing a state's salary scale, data about the current early childhood workforce is critical. Many states use workforce studies to provide key data about their early educators. A workforce study surveys all early educators (or a valid sample) in a state to gather and analyze information about education, experience, tenure (to assess turnover), wages, benefits, roles, hours, key demographics and more. Surveys also typically collect information about the programs in which educators work. Results are synthesized into a snapshot report about the workforce. In addition, data trends (about wages, benefits, etc.) can be analyzed when workforce studies are completed at intervals over time. Child Care Services Association (CCSA) has produced <u>workforce studies</u> for the state of North Carolina as well as other constituents for a number of years.

An early childhood workforce registry is another data source in many states (particularly when the registry is mandatory). Using wage data enables scale developers to understand the current and historical landscape (if longitudinal data is available) and make informed decisions about the wage scale. Illinois used data from its robust registry and a salary survey to document current wages.

Two vital data points are knowledge of state and/or regional wages and the current cost of living. Both the <u>MIT living wage calculator</u> and the Center for Women's Welfare's <u>Self-Sufficiency Standard</u> are examples of tools that can be used to determine the wages an individual or family needs to earn to minimally cover basic expenses in a state or county. These tools are useful, especially to understand the gaps between current wages, living wages, competitive wages and the funding needed to close the gaps.

If the salary scale for community-based early childhood programs is going to be tied to public school teacher wages, the state's wage scale and average benefits of that workforce are needed. Contact the state's education department or work with local school districts and advocates to find the most current scale available. Be sure to include

¹⁰ https://www.dcvf.wa.gov/sites/default/files/pdf/reports/CompensationTechWrkgrpRprt.pdf, p. 1

⁹ <u>https://cscce.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Strategies-in-Pursuit-of-Pre-K.pdf</u>

¹¹ https://cscce.berkeley.edu/workforce-index-2020/, p. 109

the public school teacher assistant role in the request for information, if it is to be included in the scale.

Finally, having a working knowledge of the state's current licensing requirements for child care and pre-K educators, along with the Head Start and Early Head Start lead and assistant teacher educational qualifications, is important when setting levels and dollar amounts. Licensing data related to qualifications is available <u>here</u>. The Power to the Profession levels and/or the state's career lattice can be used in conjunction with licensing education requirements to best determine how to configure the wage scale.

FINANCING

Existing public funding does not provide enough affordable, high quality early care and education for all eligible children, nor is there sufficient funding to provide fair wages for the workforce. When considering a wage scale, it is critical to identify additional dollars through a variety of financing/revenue mechanisms that may include local, state and national sources. Identified funds need to have revenue streams dedicated to early childhood educator wages or clear directions to use a portion of the new funds for this purpose, and be likely to be enacted. Each state has its own revenue policy opportunities and constraints, as do localities that may choose to move forward when a state cannot or will not. A recent report¹² provides examples of financing options that could be used to generate funds for improved wages and wage scales. The state of Washington illustrates these principles through the sustainable financing structure it enacted into law.

ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

The dire state of the early childhood workforce—undercompensated, undervalued and leaving the field in large numbers for less strenuous, higher paying jobs—has been the impetus for states to take action on compensation needs. While a salary scale is only one component of the comprehensive strategies needed to stabilize the workforce and thus the early childhood system, it is a critical step that cannot be left out of deliberations and planning.

The decision points outlined in this paper provide several considerations for salary scale development. Additional recommendations include:

- Engage a group of stakeholders that represent the early childhood workforce and its allies. Be certain that the membership represents the diversity of the community and represents all voices equitably.
- 2. Work with state and municipal leaders to determine how a

wage scale fits into new or existing funding streams, how it will be administered and how it will be rolled out (regionally, incrementally, etc.).

- **3.** Work with economic development departments and tax experts, among others, to look at financing options to take the next steps forward.
- **4.** Importantly, be aware of potential unintended consequences. *For example:*
 - a. If the scale is to be used only for pre-K teachers, what are the implications for community-based settings that have both pre-K and other educators?
 - b. Will any requirements for increased wages destabilize the finances of programs if sufficient funding is not available?
 - c. Could an early educator earn more than a program's director or manager once a wage scale is adopted?
 - d. Finally, pay attention to how increases in early educators' wages impact eligibility for public benefits that many use. For example, in Nebraska, like in many states, 20% of the center-based workforce needed some form of assistance in 2020. Minimally raising wages could risk that eligibility by causing the educator to exceed SNAP eligibility requirements, for example, or not providing sufficient wages to purchase health care on the open market (since many ECE employers do not offer health insurance).
- **5.** Once the salary scale is in its final draft, vet it across the state to ensure buy-in, identify any last minute concerns and confirm that the scale's levels and increments are appropriate.

CONCLUSION

This white paper, *A Look at Salary/Wage Scales for the Early Childhood Educator Workforce*, provides a sample of state planning efforts aimed at improving wages across the field. As a moment in time, this paper documents that while several states have plans underway, the complexity of financing early childhood education has left almost all states at the planning phase. Aside from Washington, the only exceptions are states that have focused on pre-K teachers, but even in those cases, it is not unusual for a wage scale to be limited to only some pre-K teachers.¹³ It is this paper's intent to provide states with the knowledge they need to begin developing early childhood workforce salary scales. At the same time, more work will need to be done across the country to support the workforce and offer wages that allow educators to continue the work that inspires them and enables them to, at a minimum, adequately provide for themselves and their families.

Implementation of this wage scale is predicated on increased funding for the industry. In the absence of additional resources, it is unlikely that the industry would be able to implement this wage scale without putting programs out of business and pricing most families out of the market."

-Minnesota Early Care and Education Wage Scale, MN Employment and Economic Development, March 2021

¹² https://buildinitiative.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/Funding-Our-Future-FINAL-2019.9.24.pdf

¹³ https://cscce.berkeley.edu/strategies-in-pursuit-of-pre-k-teacher-compensation-parity/

APPENDIX I

GLOSSARY

Early Educator

Teachers, assistants, site directors and others whose primary role is working directly with the children in their care.

Early Care and Education (ECE)

All center-based, school-based and family child care settings where education and care are the daily routine for children ages birth-5.

Living Wage

Refers to a minimum wage required to meet basic needs. A living wage varies by household type and the local cost of living. The Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) hosts a Living Wage Calculator for U.S. states and counties.

Power to the Profession

The National Association for the Education of Young Children's (NAEYC) national collaborative work to define the roles and responsibilities of the early care and education profession. The work also includes recommendations on preparation and pathways, compensation and infrastructure.

Salary Scale, Wage Scale or Salary Schedule

"A scale with clearly differentiated salary increments based on qualifications and years of experience, which provides guidance for salary increases over time."¹ A salary scale creates a transparent and equitable system for setting wages.

Self-Sufficiency Standard

Developed by the Center for Women's Welfare, the standard is a living wage budget-based tool to define the real cost of living at a minimally adequate level for working families.

Wage Parity

Creating equivalency in wages between two groups. Within the context of early care and education, parity is often focused on creating equivalency between early educators who have the same credentials as public school teachers, specifically school-based pre-K teachers compared to community-based pre-K teachers. A wage schedule can use school-based pre-K or K-3 wages as the benchmark against which all other salaries are scaled. Wage parity does not address benefits as would occur if full compensation parity was the goal.

Workforce Study

A survey of the early care and education workforce in a state, region or community. Workforce studies provide comprehensive data about early childhood educators working in licensed programs. These studies also provide data about the programs in which the educators work (some workforce studies might include unlicensed, registered child care providers or other early childhood professionals as determined by the scope of the project). Change can be documented when workforce studies occur every few years.

APPENDIX II

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION WAGE SCALE CROSSWALK OF SEVERAL STATES' PLANNING EFFORTS®

STATE	VISION	GOALS/GUIDING PRINCIPLES	RECOMMENDATIONS/STRATEGIES	SCALE FEATURES	PROPOSED ELIGIBILITY	PARITY Recommended?	BENEFITS Recommended?	LEGISLATION	ENACTED
CONNECTICUT	An early childhood educator compen- sation schedule for state- funded programs.	Bachelor's degree with ECE concentration for all lead educators working in state-funded programs with children birth through age 8.	Action I: Secure funds to ensure state-funded EC programs can recruit and retain an adequately and appropriately compensated workforce; II: Strengthen access to higher education programs that adhere to common EC workforce prep standards; III: Fully implement a workforce development system to ensure degree attainment.	Education, training and experience.	Early educators in programs that accept state funds.	Not yet addressed.	Yes.	Public Act 19-61.	Legislation passed and signed into law. Work is ongoing.

An Act Requiring the Office of Early Childhood to Develop A Proposed Early Childhood Educator Compensation Schedule, 2019 https://docplayer.net/18148557-A-plan-to-assist-early-education-state-funded-providers-to-degree-attainment-and-increased-compensation.html, 2015

SIONITI	ECE wages equitable to other positions requiring com- parable education and skills.	Compensation, benefits, parity and supportive work environments.	Ten strategies including adjusting rates, tax incentives and loan forgiveness.	Education and experience. Wages for all positions (e.g., cooks) are included and recommended above new minimum wage laws.	All EC educators.	Parity between pre-K school- based teachers and public school teachers. Recommended for other IL EC staff: approximate parity with average salaries across fields for those with comparable levels of education.	Yes. Bureau of Labor Statistics were used to set recommended rates for worker's compensa- tion, health insurance and retirement.		Wage scale enacted for school- based pre-K educators.
---------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	-------------------------------------------------------------------------

Achieving Compensation Parity: Illinois Goal for the Field of Early Childhood Care and Education, January, 2016

Consensus Statement on Early Childhood Educator Compensation, August, 2019

Early Childhood Funding Commission Full Report, Spring, 2021

Cost Model for Early Childhood Education and Care Services, February, 2021

APPENDIX II

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION WAGE SCALE CROSSWALK OF SEVERAL STATES' PLANNING EFFORTS[®] continued from page 8

STATE	VISION	GOALS/GUIDING PRINCIPLES	RECOMMENDATIONS/STRATEGIES	SCALE FEATURES	PROPOSED ELIGIBILITY	PARITY Recommended?	BENEFITS RECOMMENDED?	LEGISLATION	ENACTED
MINNESOTA	A diverse, qualified, well- supported and fairly compen- sated ECE workforce across all settings.	Fair and equitable wages.	Reform financing so ECE is fully funded as a public good.	Education, training, certification and respon- sibilities.	All EC educators.	Wage parity with Kindergarten through 12th grade teachers recommended; did not address a 12-month, 40-hour week.	No.		Not yet enacted.
	<u>Minnesota E</u> <u>Transformin</u>	Early Care and Education g the Financing of Early	<u>Idhood Workforce</u> , January, 2019 <u>n Wage Scale</u> , March, 2021 Care and Education in Minnesota, 2021 Vorkforce: Compensation Reform, 2021						
NEBRASKA	The ECE work- force is a priority profession benefitting all children from birth through grade 3.	A highly qualified workforce; full funding by 2030; work standards and compensation linked to credentials and expertise.	High quality practice, professional pathways, locally informed workforce cost estimates and closing the funding gap.	Education. The scale does not vary by ages of children served.	Birth through third grade.	Parity with kindergarten teachers recommended, plus 10% more for 12-month schedule.	Yes.		Not yet enacted.

Elevating NE's EC Workforce: Report & Recommendations, January, 2020

APPENDIX II

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION WAGE SCALE CROSSWALK OF SEVERAL STATES' PLANNING EFFORTS[®] continued from page 9

STATE	VISION	GOALS/GUIDING PRINCIPLES	RECOMMENDATIONS/STRATEGIES	SCALE FEATURES	PROPOSED ELIGIBILITY	PARITY RECOMMENDED?	BENEFITS RECOMMENDED?	LEGISLATION	ENACTED		
NORTH CAROLINA	Fair salaries commen- surate with education or certifi- cation.	A standard scale based on parity with entry-level public school teachers.	Local ECE programs use it to create minimum standards for education and compensation.	Education.	All EC educators.	Wage parity with public school teachers recommended; did not address a 12-month, 40-hour week.	No.		Not yet enacted.		
Z	NC Early Ch	NC Early Childhood Compensation Collaborative Model Salary Scale for Early Education Teachers, October, 2021									

Among other strategies: Education Goal for Parity with HB 3380, А New funding No. Enacted models based on Compensate and recognize EC and all EC public school 2015, and roadmap in three HB 4327, to ensure cost of service. educators as professional. Set experience. educators, kindergarten stateboth minimum and target salary Target teachers and funded all currently is 2019. children guidelines. salaries are teachers and assistants programs. to be linked enter assistants recommended. OREGON school to the in three state-funded ready to median, learn. regional programs. kindergarten teacher salary.

Establishing Minimum and Target Salaries for Preschool Promise Teachers, 2016 Raise Up Oregon: A Statewide Early Learning System Plan, 2019

Raise Up Oregon Progress Report 2019-2020, 2021

APPENDIX II

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION WAGE SCALE CROSSWALK OF SEVERAL STATES' PLANNING EFFORTS[®] continued from page 10

STATE	VISION	GOALS/GUIDING Principles	RECOMMENDATIONS/STRATEGIES	SCALE FEATURES	PROPOSED ELIGIBILITY	PARITY RECOMMENDED?	BENEFITS Recommended?	LEGISLATION	ENACTED
RHODE ISLAND	A strong, coordi- nated system of programs and services that supports children birth- age 8.	Wage enhancement strategies for recruitment and retention of the infant toddler workforce.	Adopt and use a statewide target wage scale linked to education for infant toddler educators, Early Intervention and family home visiting staff.	Education.	Original recommen- dations focused on birth-3 educators and pending legislation includes all ages for child care educators, RI Pre-K home visiting and Early Intervention.	Parity with public school kindergarten teachers recommended, plus adjustment for 12-month schedule.	No.	2021 Early Educator Investment Act bill passed the State Senate but not the House.	Not yet enacted but some RI Pre-K teachers have wage parity with entry level kindergarten teachers.

Improving the Compensation and Retention of Effective Infant/Toddler Educators in Rhode Island, 2019 Recommendations Endorsed by RI Early Learning Council, 2019

ASHINGTON	An ECE workforce that is appro- priately prepared and supported.	Increase wages, reduce turnover, increase qualifications and maintain diversity.	EC educators receive a competitive compensation package comparable to Kindergarten-3rd grade educators (2019 report).	Education, experience, responsi- bility, ECE credits and training requirements.	Birth through third grade.	Parity with Kindergarten- 3rd grade teachers recommended.	Yes, with funds to expand health care coverage.	Fair Start for Kids Act (SB 5237) RCW 43.216.675 and RCW 43.216.680	Enacted May 2021.
-----------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------

http://lawfilesext.leg.wa.gov/biennium/2021-22/Pdf/Bills/Session%20Laws/Senate/5237-S2.SL.pdf?q=20210827111448 Compensation Technical Workgroup Report to Washington State Legislature, 2019 RCW 43.216.675 and RCW 43.216.680



Washington [state] must ensure its workforce is appropriately prepared and supported. **Educator wages must be considered** when examining the cost of quality and recognize that workforce compensation is a key indicator of outcomes for children."

> -Compensation Technical Workgroup Report to the Washington State Legislature, April 2019

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Child Care Services Association (CCSA) is grateful to the Alliance for Early Success for encouraging the development of this white paper, **A** *Look at Salary/Wage Scales for the Early Childhood Educator Workforce*. Thanks also to Caitlin McLean of the Center for the Study of Child Care Employment/University of California Berkley and Adele Robinson of Policy & Advocacy Solutions for their outside review of drafts of the work. We acknowledge the contributions of the colleagues in each of the highlighted states who reviewed their state's data in the Crosswalk. Finally, thank you to Cass Wolfe, CCSA's Chief Strategy Officer, as the researcher and lead writer.

-Marsha Basloe, President, CCSA



CHILD CARE SERVICES ASSOCIATION

PO Box 901 Chapel Hill, NC 27514

